

Action Taken Report on the Comments from Peer Reviewer on “Geological Report on Reconnaissance Survey (G-4) For REE and Associated Minerals in Sumarasar area, District- Kachchh, Gujarat”

Sr. No	Comments from Peer Reviewer	Action Taken on the Comments
1	Reconcile the sanctioned and investigated block areas, title, coordinates, CRS and all plate/database fields	The block polygon has been recomputed on GIS and encloses 100.20 sq. km, which is now adopted uniformly across the text, tables, annexures and plates. The title “REE and Phosphorite” in conformity with the Sanction Order. The coordinate reference system is correctly adopted as to WGS-84 / UTM Zone 42N
2	Provide a formal approved-scope-versus-achievement statement explaining each omitted component and its effect on geological confidence.	Section 10.2.0 of the Geological Report carries a component-wise statement of approved scope against achievement.
3	Submit a complete interval ledger for all 47 auger holes, clearly marking assayed and unassayed material, recovery and selection criteria.	Annexure II-D submitted with the Geological Report carries the depth-wise litholog of all 47 auger boreholes. Annexure II-C gives the depth-wise analysis of 34 elements for all 94 auger samples. Plate VIII presents the corresponding graphic lithologs at 1:100 scale.
4	Include full internal and external QA/QC data, acceptance criteria and statistical evaluation; revise the report only after QA/QC passes.	The external check analyses of 17 samples for 34 elements are placed at Annexure III, with the statistical evaluation at new Section 15.3.0
5	Statistically reanalyse the REE dataset by sample medium, lithology, formation and stratigraphic position using medians, percentiles, outlier review, cross-sections and grade-thickness plots.	The lithology wise ranges of elemnets with their mean value has already been furnished. Chondrite normalize diagram for REE is also provided in Chapter VII

6	Correct the statement on samples exceeding 1000 ppm and audit all calculated Σ REE+Y values against the primary tables.	All 169 Σ REE+Y values have been rechecked element-by-element from the primary tables and reconcile with the figures reported in the Geological Report. The audit confirms one sample above 1000 ppm — SMR/BRS/49 at 1527.80 ppm as reports, the next highest being SMR/BRS/03 at 991.41 ppm, while the maximum values in the pit and auger populations are 527.42 ppm and 694.15 ppm respectively. Sections 7.4.5, 21.1.6 and the Executive Summary stand corrected to read one sample in place of "a few".
7	Undertake targeted P_2O_5 analyses before concluding the phosphorite objective, or explicitly state that this objective remains incompletely tested.	The exploration of Sumarasar Area was formulated for REE and Associated minerals. During the exploration work, no limestone, dolomite or chert host horizon was encountered in 100.20 sq. km of mapping, in 10 pits or in 47 auger boreholes; every lithological unit was tested in the field by Shapiro's rapid phosphate method without indication of a persistent or nodular phosphatic horizon; and EPMA on both Sumarasar polished sections detected no phosphate rich mineral, although apatite, collophane and fluoroapatite phases were identified in the same analytical batch in sections from adjoining blocks.
8	Correct XRD duplication, provide a petrography/XRD/EPMA-to-assay crosswalk, and confirm key REE/phosphate minerals by microanalytical data.	Annexure V for XRD analyses has been checked. SMRXRD-16 to 20 are five independent samples drawn from the same lithological unit and the same horizons as SMRXRD-1 to 5, and their identical assemblages reflect the mineralogical uniformity of those horizons. A petrography–XRD–EPMA–assay interpretation is added in mineralization section of GR.